

Rockford Historic Preservation Commission

January 11, 2011 — 6:00 PM

- Present:** Janna Bailey, Scott Sanders, David Hagney, Doug Mark, Vickie Krueger
- Absent:** Mark McInnis, Maureen Flanagan
- Staff:** Jessica Roberts Historic Preservation Secretary, John Giliberti Legal Department
- Other:** Winnebago County Representatives Chris Dornbush and Jim Hughes Building Inspector Head, Joe Derr (Applicant), Rodney Beagle (Applicant)
-

Approval of Minutes

A **MOTION** was made by Scott Sanders to **APPROVE** the minutes of the December 14th meeting as presented. The **Motion** was **SECONDED** by Alderman Doug Mark and **CARRIED** by a vote of 5-0.

New Business

Winnebago County Item Blackhawk Island Structure (Unincorporated)

Ms. Roberts indicated that Winnebago County had contacted her to put the item on the agenda per the request of the state. She stated that she contacted the State Office to inform them that it was not in the City of Rockford Jurisdiction but that the Commission could comment on it as the County does not have a board to review such matter.

Jim Hughes, Director of Special Services for Winnebago County and Chris Dornbush, Catagraphic Specialist and with the Planning Department of Winnebago County presented the item. Mr. Hughes stated that they are working on a buyout opportunity for FEMA and it was brought to their attention that one structure was made out of limestone and asked to research and review the structure for any historical reference. They presented a packet indicating the structure and showing the photos of every side of the structure. The subdivision plat of the island was also submitted. They indicated that they were not able to find the specific date of when the structure was built. They added that the Rockford Township office estimated that it was built in 1920. A title search was done with the earliest deed found in 1930. They indicated the acquisition of the area is about 25% owned by County or the Airport and stated that they are hoping to be able to purchase all of the in the green so that it cannot be able to built on any longer. Mr. Hughes stated that they also did research on Camp Grant and the research indicated that the 1917 Camp Grant map excluded the island. The grant is known as the FEMA Community Redevelopment Block Grant Community Disaster. Scott Sanders asked whether the goal would be to have no one living there. Mr. Hughes stated that is correct the idea is to give it over to the Forest Preserve and everything is to be brought into green space. Scott Sanders asked if there was any chance that the Forest preserve would be interested in this. Mr. Hughes stated no, there really isn't.

Mr. Sanders asked whether anyone had found any significant Historical determination as it relates to the use. Ms. Roberts and Mr. Hughes and Dornbush indicated no. The research had been done but no use significance was found. Mr. Sanders stated that this is one building, stand alone; it is not any part of a group of homes in this area of this period. Staff indicated no. Mr. Hughes added that any future structures that were built would need to be elevated.

Alderman Mark stated that it is categorized as low contribution. It has a historical status only because it was built in the 20's. He added that it is in the flood plain as well. Mr. Sanders stated that it doesn't have any contribution to a district either.

Alderman Mark made a **MOTION** to **NOT OBJECT** to the demolition of the structure and that staff right a letter to that effect to the IHPA and Winnebago County. The **Motion** was **SECONDED** by Scott Sanders and **CARRIED** by a vote of 5-0.

Certificate of Appropriateness

327 South 3rd Street Roof Replacement

Mr. Beagle presented the requested and stated that the new roof is to be an exact replacement with same colors and same roofing asphalt shingles along with the same size and dimensions.

A **MOTION** was made by Alderman Doug Mark to **APPROVE** the roof replacement at 327 South 3rd Street with the same matching maple-red blend certain teed asphalt shingles. The **Motion** was **SECONDED** by Vickie Krueger and **CARRIED** by a vote of 5-0.

Old Business

Certificate of Appropriateness

315 South 3rd Garage Reconstruction

Mr. Derr, the applicant, provided the proposed siding sample and showed the garage replacement along with further detail on the garage. Scott Sanders asked if the applicant would maintain the fish scales and dormer. Joe Derr stated yes. Scott Sanders asked whether he would be keeping the same soffit detail. Joe Derr stated yes. Mr. Hagney asked whether the entry or (man door) is wood. Joe Derr stated that the proposed door has glass. David Hagney asked whether he would be alright with a solid wood door. Mr. Derr stated that a wood door would be ideal for security reasons as well. David Hagney asked if the exposure would be the same and if Mr. Derr would be agreeable to use smooth siding rather than wood grain. Mr. Derr stated yes the exposure would be the same and the smooth wood is agreeable. David Hagney asked that Ms. Roberts read the criteria on doors. Ms. Roberts went over the door replacement criteria. Scott Sanders asked the commission if they are establishing a panel door consistent with the man door. Alderman Doug Mark asked if we are going to do panel on the service door to be consistent. David asked the applicant if his insurance is paying for new garage. The applicant stated yes they have settled but he will need to take a loan out for the garage as the amount of money will not cover the new garage. Alderman Mark stated that he is really pleased with the work that the applicant has done on the home. There was some discussion on the service door and how to construct the door to look like the existing garage.

A **MOTION** was made by Alderman Doug Mark to **APPROVE** the Certificate of Appropriateness to reconstruct the garage at 315 South 3rd Street subject to the site plan and the materials as indicated along with the solid wood man door subject to the condition that the applicant come before the board to approve the garage service door prior to installation. The Motion was **SECONDED** by Scott Sanders and **CARRIED** by a vote of 5-0.

Staff Report

409-415 Kishwaukee Street Demolition

John Giliberti, City Attorney, said the HPC by-laws do not allow the Board to reconsider the Board's denial of a certificate of appropriateness (COA) for the already demolished garage on the subject property. Attorney Giliberti indicated he spoke with the property owner's attorney, Doug Henry, and told Henry his client could apply for a COA for landscaping the property, however due to the Board's jurisdiction on a COA, any proposed landscaping had to be completely on the subject property. Attorney Giliberti stated that the Boards' denial of the COA for demolition is a final administrative decision which can be appealed in court. Commissioner Sanders asked if the outcome of the denial of the COA for demolition would be the status quo. Attorney Giliberti stated that that was a possibility. When asked about the Board

pursuing the matter, Attorney Giliberti said that was an option adding if the property owner was found liable, the minimum fine per day of violation is \$500. Commissioner/Alderman Mark asked Attorney Giliberti for an explanation why the Board cannot revisit the denial of the COA for demolition. Attorney Giliberti said that the Board's bylaws allow for reconsideration for landmark designations but not COA's. Commissioner Hagney said as one of the three people that voted against the COA for demolition, it he cannot condone the demolition that was done before the property owner applied for a COA to demolish. Commissioner Sanders asked whether the Board could leave the COA for demolition as a failed motion but demand the property owner landscape the subject property. Commissioner/Alderman Mark said that somewhere down the line there has to be repercussions if the property owner does not landscape the subject property. The Board directed Attorney Giliberti to speak with attorney Doug Henry, the property owner's attorney, and inform him about the Board's desire his client landscape the property where the garage was demolished. The Board indicated the property owner can saw cut the slab where the garage formerly stood and put landscaping in that area. The Board concurred that if the property owner does not landscape the area of the demolition, the Board would entertain the idea of pursuing the demolition of the garage without a COA in court.

A **MOTION** was made by Alderman Mark, to direct Legal staff to speak with the applicant's attorney. The **Motion** was **SECONDED** by Vickie Krueger and **CARRIED** by a vote of 5-0.

Other

With no other business a **MOTION** was made by Alderman Doug Mark to adjourn the meeting of January 11, 2011. The **Motion** was **SECONDED** by David Hagney and **CARRIED** by a vote of 5-0.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:55p.m.

Submitted by Jessica Roberts, Rockford Historic Preservation Secretary